Cost Analysis of UV-C Treatment and Conventional Fungicide Treatment of Cucumber to Control Downy Mildew

LNE19-388R: Control of Cucumber Downy Mildew through Nighttime Application of Ultraviolet Light Before and After Infection

Mount Sinai Light and Health Research Center

April 2022

This material is based upon work supported by the National Institute of Food and Agriculture, U.S. Department of Agriculture, through the Northeast Sustainable Agriculture Research and Education program under subaward number LNE19-388R.

The following document contains an analysis which captures the costs associated with the various treatments evaluated in this research project. A quantitative survey of yield for the various conditions evaluated was deemed to be impractical; however, the producer noted that there was no discernable yield difference among the various treatments. Accordingly, the following analyses will focus solely on the costs associated with the various treatments on a per-acre basis up to 25 acres, which is the practical limit of a 2-row UV treatment attachment built to the specifications defined in subsequent sections. The table below summarizes the cost analysis data, which is calculated in the sections that follow.

Summary of Per-Acre Costs for Various Treatments

		Weekly	UV + Weekly	UV + Weekly DM	UV + Fungicide
Acres Treated	UV Only	Fungicide	Fungicide	Targeted Fungicide	Every-Other Week
1	\$243.59	\$681.40	\$924.99	\$646.62	\$607.51
5	\$243.59	\$541.22	\$784.81	\$506.44	\$529.63
10	\$243.59	\$523.70	\$767.29	\$488.92	\$519.90
25	\$243.59	\$513.18	\$756.77	\$478.40	\$514.06

Costs Associated with UV Treatments:

The field trial conducted in 2020 investigated the efficacy of various UV-C doses. Statistical analyses of the data from that trial showed no reliable differences among 120, 240, and 480 J·m⁻² UV-C doses. Accordingly, the following analysis utilizes a dose of 240 J·m⁻². Entries marked with an asterisk (*) are based on assumptions explained below.

Cost Analysis of UV Treatment

Ground speed to achieve dose (240 J·m ⁻²)	1.25 MPH
Row unit width	5 ft width
UV treatment rate (240 J·m ⁻²)	1.32 hr/acre
Generator Fuel consumption per hour *	0.33 gallons/hr
Fuel use	0.44 gallons/acre
Average fuel cost *	4.26 \$/gallon
Average hourly rate for equipment operator *	\$17.44

Per acre cost to apply UV using Single row UV Unit

Fuel cost	\$1.86
Labor cost	\$23.02
Total cost per acre/treatment	\$24.88

Per acre cost to apply UV using Double row UV Unit

Fuel cost	\$3.71
Labor cost	\$11.51
Total cost per acre/treatment	\$15.22

Total cost of UV application for a planting

Treatments (8 weeks, 2x/week)	10
Total cost using SINGLE row unit	\$398.04 p

Total cost using SINGLE row unit \$398.04 per acre
Total cost using DOUBLE row unit \$243.59 per acre

UV treatment assumptions and notes:

- Fuel consumption is calculated from manufacturer stated run time and fuel tank capacity.
- Fuel price represents average for unleaded gasoline for northeast states as of April 5, 2022: https://gasprices.aaa.com/
- National average hourly rate for agricultural equipment operator provided by the US Bureau of Labor Statistics report dated May 2021: https://www.bls.gov/oes/current/oes452091.htm

<u>Costs Associated with Conventional Fungicide Treatments:</u>

The cost analysis of the conventional fungicide treatments is based on actual products applied during the 2021 field trial. The cost analysis includes material as well as labor, both fixed and variable. Fixed labor is related to the time required to apply the fungicide products on a per-acre basis. The labor required to mix a sprayer load, clean up after application, and make appropriate documentation is a fixed amount of time regardless of the number of acres treated. Accordingly, the cost of this labor on a per-acre basis depends on the number of acres treated and is referred to as the variable labor cost. Estimates are included for 1, 5, 10, and 25 acres treated, to illustrate the effect of treatment area on cost. Entries marked with an asterisk (*) are based on assumptions explained below.

Labor Costs:

Fixed Labor	Cost per A	cre	Total Labor Co	ost of Co	nventional	Fungicide
Speed of sprayer*	2 N	1PH				
Assumed Width	30 ft		Total Labor	er Conv	entional Tr	eatment
Treatment Rate	7.27 a	cres/hr	Acres treated	Fixed	Variable	Total
Heatment Nate	0.138 h	r/acre	1	\$2.68	\$19.47	\$22.15
Labor Rate*	19.47 \$	/hr	5	\$2.68	\$3.89	\$32.86
Labor cost per acre	2.68 \$	/acre	10	\$2.68	\$1.95	\$46.24
			25	\$2.68	\$0.78	\$86.40
Variable Labo	r Cost per A	\cre*				
Setup/Cleanup Time	* 1 h	r	Total Labor	for all W	eekly Trea	atments
			(9	total tre	atments)	
	per acre A	cres treated	Acres treated	Per Tre	eatment	Total
	\$19.47	1	1	\$2:	2.15	\$199.32
Labor for Mixing,	\$3.89	5	5	\$3:	2.86	\$295.70
Cleanup, etc	\$1.95	10	10	\$4	6.24	\$416.17
	\$0.78	25	25	\$8	6.40	\$777.58
			Labor for Eve	ery-Othe	r Week Tre	eatments
			(5	total tre	atments)	
			Acres treated	Per Tre	eatment	Total
			1	\$2:	2.15	\$110.74
			5	\$3:	2.86	\$164.28
			10	\$4	6.24	\$231.21
			25	\$8	6.40	\$431.99

Conventional fungicide labor assumptions and notes:

- Spraying speed and time to mix, clean spray equipment, and make proper documentation provided by cooperating producer.
- Variable labor cost analysis assumes enough fungicide material to treat the acrages listed can be mixed in one batch (taking 1 hour of labor).
- National average hourly rate for pesticide applicator provided by the US Bureau of Labor Statistics report dated May 2021: https://www.bls.gov/oes/current/oes373012.htm

Conventional Fungicide Material Costs:

Conventional Fungicide Materials Used in 2021 Field Trial

				Full P	rogram	DM Only I	Program
Product	Rate Per Acre	\$/Unit	\$/Acre	Application	s Total Cost	Applications	Total Cost
Gatten	6.4 oz	\$4.53	\$29.00	2	\$58.00	0	\$0.00
Initiate 720	2 pt	\$9.38	\$18.75	1	\$18.75	1	\$18.75
Kocide 3000	1 lb	\$11.25	\$11.25	1	\$11.25	1	\$11.25
Luna Senation	6.4 oz	\$7.56	\$48.40	1	\$48.40	0	\$0.00
Microthiol	6 lb	\$1.73	\$10.40	2	\$20.80	0	\$0.00
Nordox 75WG	1.1 lb	\$8.48	\$9.33	1	\$9.33	1	\$9.33
Omega 500F*	1 pt	\$61.65	\$61.65	1	\$61.65	1	\$61.65
OxiDate 5.0	2 pt	\$5.35	\$10.70	1	\$10.70	1	\$10.70
Previcur Flex	1.2 pt	\$11.25	\$13.50	2	\$27.00	2	\$54.00
Procure 480SC	6.4 oz	\$3.91	\$25.00	1	\$25.00	0	\$0.00
Rampart*	2 pt	\$3.60	\$7.20	1	\$7.20	1	\$7.20
Ranman	2.4 oz	\$8.50	\$20.40	3	\$61.20	0	\$0.00
Rhyme	7 oz	\$3.98	\$27.86	1	\$27.86	0	\$0.00
Tanos	10 oz	\$3.08	\$30.83	1	\$30.83	1	\$30.83
Torino	3.2 oz	\$8.71	\$27.86	1	\$27.86	0	\$0.00
Vivando	16 oz	\$2.27	\$36.25	1	\$36.25	0	\$0.00
				\$482.08	8 per acre	\$203.71	per acre

Fungicide material assumptions and notes:

- Product pricing sourced by averaging various online vendors' pricing as of April 2022.
- Online pricing for Omega 500F and Rampart could not be found online, so pricing for other products with the same precentage of active ingredient(s) was substituted for this analysis.

Total Cost of Conventional Fungicide Treatments:

T	otal Cost for	Weekly Ap	plication	IS			Total Cos	st fo	r for Ever	y-Other V	Veek Applica	tions
	(9 tota	application	ns)						(5 total	application	ons)	
Acres treated	Material	Labor	Total		Per acre	Acre	s treated	M	aterial	Labor	Total	Per acre
1	\$482.08	\$199.32	\$681.4	0	\$681.40		1	\$2	53.19	\$110.74	\$363.92	\$363.92
5	\$2,410.40	\$295.70	\$2,706.	10	\$541.22		5	\$1,	265.94	\$164.28	\$1,430.22	\$286.04
10	\$4,820.80	\$416.17	\$5,236.	97	\$523.70		10	\$2,	531.88	\$231.21	\$2,763.09	\$276.31
25	\$12,052.00	\$777.58	\$12,829	.59	\$513.18		25	\$6,	329.70	\$431.99	\$6,761.69	\$270.47
		Tot	al Cost fo	r W	eekly Ap	olication	of DM Ma	ateri	als Only			
					(9 total	applicati	ons)		1			
		Acres	treated	Ma	aterial	Labor	Total	I	Per acre			
			1	\$2	03.71	\$199.32	\$403.0	03	\$403.03			
			5	\$1,	018.55	\$295.70	\$1,314.	.25	\$262.85			
			10	\$2,	037.10	\$416.17	\$2,453.	.27	\$245.33			
			25	\$5.	092.75	\$777.58	\$5,870.	.33	\$234.81			

Cost of Combination Approaches:

The 2021 field trial tested two combination approaches: UV-C plus the full conventional fungicide program (weekly application), and UV plus conventional fungicide applied every two weeks. The full combination of UV-C and fungicide produced better control than conventional alone when applied on black mulch, and equivalent control on reflective mulch. The second combination approach of every-other-week fungicide application demonstrated better control than UV alone, but not as good as the full fungicide-only program.

A third combination approach could involve the removal of materials specifically targeting powdery mildew (PM) from weekly fungicide applications. While this combination was not tested in either field trial, UV-C has been demonstrated in lab studies to control PM. Additionally, PM was very well controlled in the 2021 trial UV-only plots, suggesting that the application of PM targeting materials can successfully be replaced with UV-C treatment. A cost analysis for this approach is also included below.

Total Cost for Weekly Applications					Total Cost for Every-Other Week Applications					
	Acres treated	Fungicide	UV	Total	Per acre	Acres treated	Material	Labor	Total	Per acre
	1	\$681.40	\$243.59	\$924.99	\$924.99	1	\$363.92	\$243.59	\$607.51	\$607.51
	5	\$2,706.10	\$1,217.95	\$3,924.05	\$784.81	5	\$1,430.22	\$1,217.95	\$2,648.16	\$529.63
	10	\$5,236.97	\$2,435.89	\$7,672.86	\$767.29	10	\$2,763.09	\$2,435.89	\$5,198.98	\$519.90
	25	\$12,829.59	\$6,089.73	\$18,919.32	\$756.77	25	\$6,761.69	\$6,089.73	\$12,851.42	\$514.06

Total Cost f	or Weekly A	application	of DM Mater	ials Only
Acres treated	Material	Labor	Total	Per acre
1	\$403.03	\$243.59	\$646.62	\$646.62
5	\$1,314.25	\$1,217.95	\$2,532.20	\$506.44
10	\$2,453.27	\$2,435.89	\$4,889.16	\$488.92
25	\$5.870.33	\$6.089.73	\$11.960.06	\$478.40

Equipment Cost Comparison:

The build cost estimate for a two-row UV treatment attachment is compared to a price estimate for a 30-foot towed sprayer. The build cost estimate for April 2022 is based on the actual build cost of the unit used for the study, adjusted for material price fluctuations. (https://fred.stlouisfed.org/categories/33537)

Cost to Build 2-Row UV Treatment Attachment

Component	Quantity	Each	Total
Light Fixtures	10	\$225	\$2,250
Lamps	40	\$45	\$1,800
Lamp Coating	1	\$550	\$550
Electrical Supplies	1	\$280	\$280
Generator	1	\$450	\$450
Curtains	1	\$125	\$125
Steel, Hitch	1	\$1,140	\$1,140
Steel, Light Enclosure	2	\$800	\$1,600
Hardware	1	\$510	\$510
		Material Total	\$8,705
Labor	50	\$50	\$2,500
		Unit Total	\$11,205

The cost of tow-behind sprayers with 30' nominal boom was estimated by taking a median price of new units of this type listed for sale nationally on www.tractorhouse.com as of 4/15/2022.

The median price for such a sprayer was: \$6100

UV Applicator Life:

The UV lamps in the applicator unit have been life-tested to last in excess of 10,000 hours with >90% output. Generators like the one used to power the unit have an expected service life of approximately 3,000 hours. Items such as the lamps are more likely to require replacement due to accidental damage rather than degradation from to operation. The "Lamp Coating" specified in the component cost table in the provides a plastic coating that contains lamp fragments in the event of accidental damage.

The table below shows the expected life, in growing seasons, of these components for a double-row unit based on the number of acres treated assuming that no accidental breakage occurs.

	Expected Life				
	(Growing Seasons)				
Acres Treated	UV Lamps	Generator			
1	947	284			
5	189	57			
10	95	28			
25	38	11			